Retrospective Miscue Analysis
Helping Older Students Who Struggle with Reading
Catherine Compton-Lilly
“Learning from careful observation is basic to all scientific endeavors.”

- Yetta Goodman (1996, p. 600)
Miscue Analysis

- Created by Kenneth Goodman (1969)
- “Miscues reveal the strategies kids use when they read and the knowledge kids have about language”
- “Teachers come to realize that most readers self-correct only those miscues that are disruptive to reading”

(Y. Goodman, 1996, p. 602)
“I have become interested in involving students themselves in the miscue analysis process. I call readers’ reflection on their own reading process *retrospective miscue analysis*”

(Y. Goodman, 1996, p. 602)
“The RMA process helps readers become aware that they are better readers than they think they are. Ken Goodman has termed this process revaluing. Readers who revalue themselves become confident and willing to take risks.”

• Y. Goodman, 1996, p. 602
Differences between Running Records and Miscue Analyses

In miscue analysis, we do not calculate accuracy percentages.

In miscue analysis, we are primarily concerned with meaning construction.

In miscue analysis, a retelling and/or comprehension questions are always included.
Differences between Running Records and Miscue Analyses

Deviations from text are referred to as “miscues” not “errors”.

The quality of the miscue (the degree to which it carries/maintains meaning) is considered.

In miscue analysis, dialectal variations are never considered errors.

In miscue analysis, retellings are compared to the miscues made while reading.
Dialect

Miscue analysis is concerned with how much readers comprehend, not with the resolution of issues surrounding standard English usage.
RMA Driving Questions

1. How well did the reader use prior knowledge and context to predict effectively?

2. How well did the reader use following context to correct their reading?

3. How appropriately did the reader use graphic cues along with preceding and following context, plus prior knowledge?

4. Did the sentences make sense within the context of the whole text?
Basic RMA Procedure

- Interview the student about reading
- Have student choose a book to read
- Have the child read approximately 300 words of the text
- Audiotape the reading and conduct a miscue analysis (or running record)
- Have the student retell the story
- Choose a few (4-6) miscues to discuss with the reader
Basic RMA Procedure (cont.)

- Prepare a blank copy of the text, identify the counter numbers for the sentence before each miscue
- Cue up the voice file and listen with the student
- Have the student stop the recorder when he/she hears something that does not match the text
- Discuss each miscue
- Repeat the process 1-5 times as week
An Interview with John (grade 5)

- CL: When you are reading and you come to something you don’t know, what do you do?

- John: I use 5 things if I can’t sound it out. Skip it and go back, clap it out (long pause), sound it out (long pause), put some words in that I know.

- CL: Do you ever do anything else?

- John: Sometimes I just do the 5 finger count. When you first start a book if you mess up five times that is not the right book for you.
CL: Who is a good reader that you know?

John: Iesha

CL: What makes Iesha a good reader?

John: She lets me read her books. Sometimes she reads to me and I read to her.

CL: Do you think Iesha ever comes to something she doesn’t know?

John: Yeah.

CL: When Iesha comes to something she doesn’t know, what do you think she does?

John: She does the same thing as me. She does the five finger count.
CL: If you knew someone who was having trouble reading, how would you help that person?

John: Help them get a book that is right for them. Keep on trying real good to get the right book.

CL: What would your teacher do to help that person?

John: Find the right book.
CL: How did you learn to read?

John: Sounding out.

CL: Who taught you to read?

John: Myself.

CL: Did anything help you learn to read?

John: The 5 finger count and the four things.

CL: The four things you told me before?

John: Yeah.
CL: What would you like to do better as a reader?

John: Not messing up.

CL: What do you mean?

John: Whenever I read too fast, I skip the words.

CL: Do you think you’re a good reader?

John: Yeah, because I try my best.
“We have a surprise for you,” said Mother and Father.

“Is it a bicycle?” asked Arthur.

“We’re going to have a baby!” said Mother.

Oh screamed

“Ohooooo,” squealed D.W. “I love babies!”

“A baby?” said Arthur.

“Yes, in about six months,” said Father.

“Plenty of time for us to get ready.”

Arthur’s friends had lots of advice.

Bar/Barn/Barney’s

“Better get some earplugs,” said Binky Barnes, “or you’ll never sleep.”

“Forget about playing after school,” said Buster.

“You’ll have to babysit.”
“You’ll have to change all those dirty diapers!” said Muffy.

“And you’ll probably start talking baby talk,” said Francine. “Doo doo ga ga // boo boo.”

For the next few months, everywhere Arthur looked there were babies – more and more babies.

“I think babies are taking over the world!” said Arthur.

“Don’t look now,” said Buster, “but you could be in for triple trouble.”
One day after school, D.W. grabbed Arthur’s arm.

“I will teach you how to diaper a baby,” she said.

I Won’t

“Don’t worry about diapers,” said Mother.

“Come sit next to me. I want to show you something.”

Arthur age 9 months.
“Is that really me?” asked Arthur.

“Yes,” said Mother. “You were such a cute baby.”

Arthur age 1 year.

D.W. age 2 months

“Look,” said D.W. “this is me with Mommy and Daddy. Don’t I look adorable?”

D.W. age 5 months.

That Saturday morning, Mother took out her suitcase.

“Where are you going?” asked Arthur.

“The baby could come any day now,” said Mother.
“The baby could come any day now,” said Mother.

“I need to be ready for the hospital.”

“Here,” said D.W. “Something for you to look at while you’re there.”

Sunday morning, Arthur and D.W. found Grandma Thora fixing breakfast.

“You have a new sister!” she said.

“Yippee! Yippee! Yippee!” said D.W. “She’ll be just like me!”

“That’s what I’m afraid of,” said Arthur. //305
Retelling of Arthur’s Baby

John: Arthur had a new baby and he thought she would be just like D.W. and it wasn’t.

CL: Tell me more.

John: D.W. was the doctor of the house and the Mom and Dad came in and then the baby burped and the Mother and Father said “Everything all right?” She liked Arthur.

CL: Who liked Arthur?

John: The baby.
“The teacher selects miscues initially to demonstrate that the reader is making very good or smart miscues. The initial sessions are planned to help readers realize that they are using strategies that support their meaning construction as they read”

• Y. Goodman, 1996, p. 603
“During subsequent RMA sessions, the teacher selects more complex miscue patterns that may show disruption to meaning construction. Examples include miscues that the reader unsuccessfully attempts to self-correct at first, but eventually reads as expected”

• Y. Goodman, 1996, p. 604
Selection of Miscues

- Counter #166  
  Oh/Ooooo +

- Counter #166  
  screamed/squealed +

- Counter #171  
  check/change +

- Counter #169  
  adverse/advice -

- Counter #163  
  Mom/Mother -

- Counter #170  
  Barney/Barnes -

- Counter #172  
  talk/talking sc +
CL: did you hear a word that tricked you a little bit?

John: Mmm, this one? (points to Oooo)

CL: Yes, yes. this one instead of saying “oooo”, you said “oh”. (I write the substitution over the intended word) Do you see how we do that? We write the word you said on top. Ok, now let’s thing about what that said. When you said “oh” for “oooo” when you said, “We’re going to have a baby,” said mother. “Oh” screamed D.W. Did that make sense?

John: Yeah.

CL: Yeah. Did it sound OK?

John: Yeah.
CL: Yeah, it still sounded good didn’t it? Ok, so do you think that’s a miscue that’s going to mess up your reading?

John: No.

CL: No, it’s going to sometimes help you to be a good reader to make those kinds of miscues. Right?

John: Yeah.

CL: Cause you were telling me that sometimes when you get stuck on a word you should say something that makes sense, right?

John: Yeah.

CL: So you did something smart, didn’t you?
Counter #166  screamed/squealed

CL:  John, why this was a good miscue?

John:  Because whenever someone has a baby they start screaming.

CL: Yeah. Do they scream because they are getting hurt or something? Why do they scream?

John: Because they’re happy.

CL: They’re happy, right. And do little kids do that sometimes?

John: Yeah.
CL: What kind of miscue was that?

John: Good?

CL: How do you know?

John: Cause you always have to check.

CL: You check what?

John: They’re diaper if they go poopie.

CL: Yeah, that’s exactly right. When you make miscues they are smart miscues. You are a very smart reader. Let’s go and see if we can fix it up a little.
Counter #169 adverse/advice

[We listen to the tape.]

John: (Pointing to the miscued word) Advice?

CL: Advice. How did you know it was advice?

John: Because “i-c-e” spells “ice.”

CL: Oh, you are so smart. You saw part of a word you knew. If you said, “Arthur’s friends had lots of adverse,” is that a good miscue?

John: Bad.

CL: It’s not as good as the other ones is it. Why not?

John: Because um, there’s no such thing [as adverse].

We talk about what advice is and whether it makes sense.
Counter #163  Mom/Mother

John:  (Points to “mother”)

CL:  Yeah what did you say here.

John:  Mom.

CL:  You said “Mom”. Now do you think that is a good mistake or a not good mistake?

John:  (With confidence)  Good mistake.

CL:  Why?

John:  Cause mother is the same thing as mom.
Counter #163  Mom/Mother

John: Cause mother is the same thing as mom.

CL: Even though you made a good miscue, I want to show you how you can make it better. What part of the word would you have to look for to know that instead of mom it's mother?

John: “t-h-e-r”

CL: Ok, so sometimes when you read, you’re making a good miscue but you need to look all the way through words a little bit more.
We go to a similar miscue and talk through a similar example.

Then, I show John a place where he successfully checked the end of a word.
What if the people try to hurt us?
They won’t. We’re invisible to humans.
But not to animals.
Scientists are people
There are fat scientists
and thin scientists.
Tall ones and short ones.
Scientists with ponytails.
Scientists with beards.

Some scientists jog

while others weed.

They watch TV.

They write and read.

Are you a scientist too?

Look! His tongue is blue!

They play with their kids.
Eat blueberry pie.
they dance and cook
and laugh and cry.
They snore and hiccup and hug.
Just like all the other humans.
The word scientists comes from
(pause) "Skip it"

scientist
the Latin word scientia which means knowledge.

Hey! I think I see my house.

Scientists study everything:

Cats and cuts.

frog

Fire and fog

Magnets.

Earthquakes.
Earthquakes.

Flowers and

Smog.

Light and sound.

Rockets.

Stars.

Blood and bones.

Homes.

Computers.

Cars.

Are they still driving

around in those things?
Are you a scientist?

Oh, No!

I’m going home.

They work in labs.

In schools.

In space.

In forests and oceans all over the place!

In Paris.

In China. Balla Bai

In Bali.

You know, there are scientists working everywhere wherever you go!
My tongue is all twisted. I can’t say these words.

There are

micro
microbiologists,
endo-
micron
endocrinologists,
paleo-
ologic
paleontologists,
bacter-
ique
bacteriologists,
cryo-
ologists
cryobiologists,
metro-
ologists
meteorologists,
Ichlem-
ists
chemists.
Yes, you can. Try again.

And that’s just a start.

I love it! I can sing them like a song.

\[\text{can't}\]

Yes. But you don’t know what they mean.

Who cares.
Nathan: A Case Study

Seven sessions
10-15 minutes each
Every two weeks
14 Weeks
Estimates of Nathan’s Retelling Comprehension during Miscue Sessions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text/Reading Level</th>
<th>Target details/Recalled Details</th>
<th>Percent of Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Harry and the Lady Next Door (1.5)</td>
<td>5/2</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whales and Fish (2.0)</td>
<td>5/1</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Henry and Mudge in Puddle Trouble (2.5)</td>
<td>6/5</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Treeful of Pigs (2.5)</td>
<td>6/4</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glue Fingers (3.0)</td>
<td>6/4</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Little Spider (3.5)</td>
<td>6/4</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Beekeeper (3.0)</td>
<td>6/4</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Nathan: Changes in QRI Scores

QRI – preprimer level

To...

QRI Comprehension Questions (grade 2)
QRI Word List (grade 2)
QRI Retelling (grade 3; 85% to 90%)
RMA Variation: Family Miscue Analysis Session

• At least one parent, child, and coach.

• Parents and children participate together in observing oral reading and discussing high quality miscues.
RMA Variation: Family Miscue Analysis Session

Two Reasons

• Children have the opportunity to listen and reflect on their parents’ miscues.

• Parents have the opportunity to reflect critically on their understanding of reading and upon themselves as readers.
Questions for Family RMA Sessions

- Can you tell me what you did here?
- Why do you think you made the miscue?
- Does the miscue make sense?
- Does the miscue look/sound like the text?
- Was the miscue corrected? Should it have been? Why?
- Did the miscue affect your understanding of the text?
## Family RMA Weekly Sessions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Session</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Reading interviews with parent &amp; child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Miscue analysis with the child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>RMA with the child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Miscue analysis with the parent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>RMA with the parent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Miscue analysis with the child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>RMA with the child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Miscue analysis with the parent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>RMA with the parent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Miscue analysis with the child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>RMA with the child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Reading interviews with parent &amp; child</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
RMA Variation: Collaborative Retrospective Miscue Analysis

Purpose:

Help students to “gain greater independence and confidence as readers who are able to confidently discuss miscues and textual interpretation.”

(Moore & Gillis, 2005, p. 5)
RMA Variation: Collaborative Retrospective Miscue Analysis

- Two to six students
- Generally intermediate or secondary grades
- Teacher defines the composition of the group
- Students have previous experience with RMA
- Conversations about selves as readers and comprehension of text
RMA Session Organizer 1: Simple

Reader: ___________________________
Date: ___________________________
Name of Text: ___________________________

**Directions:** Write the number of the line of text, the exact text, and the miscue as read. Put a C beside the miscue as read if it was self-corrected. Circle yes or no depending on if the miscue changed the meaning of the sentence.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Line of Text</th>
<th>Text</th>
<th>Miscue as Read/C</th>
<th>Did the miscue change the meaning?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Questions to think about:**
- Does the miscue make sense?
- Does it change the meaning of the sentence?
- Why do you think the reader miscued?
- During the retelling, what connections to other text or life experiences did the reader make?

**Some topics for discussion:**

Figure 6–1. RMA–CRMA Continuum


